

E1 Review of Past Accomplishments

To develop appropriate programs to address the housing issues identified in the 2024-2032 Housing Element (6th cycle), the City of Livingston has reviewed the housing programs adopted in the 2015-2022 Housing Element (5th cycle) and evaluated the effectiveness of these programs in delivering housing services and assistance. Table E1-1 summarizes the City’s progress toward the previous Regional Housing Needs Allocation (RHNA) and Table E1-2 provides a detailed program level assessment of housing accomplishments over the 5th cycle planning period. Programs that are routine staff functions with no specific actions and no direct City involvement are not continued as housing programs in the 6th Cycle Housing Element.

E1.1 Effectiveness in Addressing Special Needs

The City was successful in facilitating the development of housing for special needs groups during the 5th Cycle Housing Element. Programs developed for the 5th cycle identified specific solutions to housing for special needs groups such as seniors, homeless, female-headed households, large families, low-income households, and/or persons with disabilities. The City has programs in place to encourage the development of affordable housing, such as Program 7 incentivizing, Program 16 reducing development fees for, and Program 20 expediting processing of affordable housing development projects. In addition, Program 22 focuses on monitoring affordable multifamily housing projects to help prevent the conversion of affordable units to market rate. Program 23 established and maintains a Housing Rehabilitation Program that provides loans for lower income households and special needs groups for rehabilitation assistance and emergency housing repairs. During the 5th Cycle, the City approved an 80-unit affordable housing project, as well as a 480-unit multifamily project. The City also updated the Zoning Code to allow for Accessory Dwelling Units (ADUs) and Junior ADUs (JADUs) in accordance with State law.

E1.2 Quantified Objectives

Table E1-1 summarizes the City’s progress toward meeting the previous 5th Cycle Housing Element RHNA, as well as objectives to rehabilitate and conserve/preserve existing housing stock. The City of Livingston did not reach its 5th cycle RHNA goals in the Extremely Low, Very Low-, Low-, and Moderate-Income categories.

Table E1-1 Quantified Housing Objective and Achieved Accomplishments

| | New Construction | | Rehabilitation | | Preservation (At-Risk Units) | |
|-----------------------|------------------|------------|----------------|--------|------------------------------|--------|
| | RHNA (2016-2024) | Actual | Objectives | Actual | Objectives | Actual |
| Extremely Low-Income | 124 | 0 | - | - | - | - |
| Very Low-Income | 125 | 0 | - | - | - | - |
| Low-Income | 178 | 9 | - | - | - | - |
| Moderate-Income | 163 | 17 | - | - | - | - |
| Above Moderate-Income | 435 | 347 | - | - | - | - |
| Total | 1,023 | 373 | - | - | - | - |

E1.3 Review of Past Accomplishments

Table E1-2 provides a detailed program-level assessment of housing accomplishments during the 5th Cycle Housing Element planning period.

Table E1-2 Review of Past Accomplishments

| Program | Program Objectives | Progress and Continued Appropriateness |
|---|---|---|
| <p>Program 1 — Housing Diversity: Use a variety of incentives including zoning and land use controls, flexible development standards, technical assistance, and expedited processing to promote affordable housing or to promote a range of housing types. Encourage and support the use of the City's Planned Development Process in the review and consideration of new housing projects. This may include exceptions to setbacks, clustering of units and lot configuration, lot size, and lot coverage.</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to approve of at least four developments that include a range of housing types.</p> | <p>The City continues to process development applications efficiently and encourages the use of Planned Development Zoning to provide flexible development standards. The City has approved three multi-family property entitlements. One three-unit building was completed. One two-unit building is under construction, and one three-unit building is pending construction.</p> <p>Continued Appropriateness: Program 1 is ongoing and will be revised and incorporated into the 6th Cycle Housing Element as Program 6.</p> |
| <p>Program 2 — Economic Development: Continue to identify and promote economic development opportunities that bring additional employment for City residents, including jobs paying a range of wages. Conduct targeted outreach to businesses in order to get them to locate in Livingston.</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to continue outreach efforts to encourage new businesses to locate in Livingston.</p> | <p>The City continues to outreach annually, depending on resource availability, to industrial and commercial businesses to locate in Livingston.</p> <p>Continued Appropriateness: Program 2 is ongoing and will be revised and incorporated into the 6th Cycle Housing Element as Program 12</p> |
| <p>Program 3 — Maintain Adequate Sites: In order to ensure that there are sufficient sites to address the City's share of the regional housing need, the City will monitor the existing inventory of available land and, if necessary, rezone land within the existing city limits or annex land within its Sphere of Influence (SOI). To ensure sufficient residential capacity is maintained to accommodate the RHNA, the City will develop and implement a formal ongoing (project-by-project) evaluation procedure pursuant to Government Code Section 65863. Should an approval of development result in a reduction of capacity below the residential capacity needed to accommodate the remaining need for lower income households, the City will identify and, if necessary, rezone sufficient sites to accommodate the shortfall and ensure "no net loss" in capacity to accommodate the RHNA. If rezoning is required to replenish the sites inventory for meeting the RHNA shortfall, the sites shall be large enough to</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to maintain the existing inventory of vacant sites suitable for residential sites and annex land, if necessary, to provide adequate sites for housing consistent with the objectives identified in the Housing Element.</p> | <p>The City continues to maintain the Vacant Site Inventory that was developed as part of the Housing Element update. The City will develop and implement a formal evaluation procedure pursuant to Government Code Section 65863.</p> <p>Continued Appropriateness: Program 3 is ongoing and will be revised and incorporated with the 6th Cycle Housing Element as Program 2.</p> |

| Program | Program Objectives | Progress and Continued Appropriateness |
|---|---|---|
| <p>accommodate at least 16 units per site at a minimum density of 20 units per acre and shall be rezoned within two years.</p> | | |
| <p>Program 4 — Tax-Sharing Agreement: Re-establish a master tax-sharing agreement with the County in order to facilitate the annexation of land within the City’s SOI when sites are needed to address housing needs.</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to complete a master tax-sharing agreement to facilitate future annexation of land.</p> | <p>The City is continuing discussion with the County of Merced regarding the Tax-Sharing Agreement.</p> <p>Continued Appropriateness: Program 4 is ongoing. The City will ensure adequate housing sites through Program 2 in the 6th Cycle Housing Element.</p> |
| <p>Program 5 — Multi-Family Lot Consolidation and Lot Split Program: In order to provide vacant parcels of adequate size to encourage affordable multi-family development, encourage the consolidation of adjacent parcels zoned High Density Residential (R-3) or Downtown Commercial (DTC) and the splitting of large R-3 zoned parcels. This may include working with property owners to consolidate parcels, coordinating with local property owners to support the development of affordable multifamily housing developments, or working with developers to identify suitable vacant adjoining R-3 or DTC sites.</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to encourage consolidated of smaller R-2 zoned lots to make affordable multi-family development feasible.</p> | <p>The City continues to encourage lot consolidation and lot splits in the R-3 zone. As development applications are submitted, City Staff reviews potential opportunities that would allow the development of additional dwelling units.</p> <p>Continued Appropriateness: Program 5 is ongoing and will be incorporated into the 6th Cycle Housing Element as Program 8.</p> |
| <p>Program 6 — Annual Reporting: Review and report annually on the implementation of Housing Element programs and the City’s effectiveness in meeting the program objectives for the prior calendar year. Present the annual report at a public hearing before submitting the annual report to the California Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD) and the Office of Planning and Research (OPR).</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to prepare an annual report on the progress toward Housing Element goals.</p> | <p>The Housing Element Annual Report is prepared each year by City Staff and presented to the Planning Commission and City Council prior to transmitting to HCD and OPR. The annual report is submitted annually in April.</p> <p>Continued Appropriateness: The City will not carry Program 6 into the 6th Cycle Housing Element as it is restating the functions of an existing city requirement.</p> |
| <p>Program 7 — Incentives for Affordable Housing: Use a variety of incentives including zoning and land use controls, flexible development standards, technical assistance, reduced development fees (see Program 16) and expedited processing (see Program 20) to promote affordable housing, including housing that meets the needs of special groups (e.g., seniors, persons with disabilities, persons with developmental disabilities, farmworkers, large households, and the homeless). Work with developers to identify sites and potential funding sources for the development of affordable housing and special needs housing.</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to incentivize at least four developments during the planning period.</p> | <p>As applications for Affordable Housing are submitted to the City, Staff will work with developers to provide technical assistance, development incentives, and expedite processing procedures.</p> <p>Continued Appropriateness: Program 7 is ongoing and will be incorporated into the 6th Cycle Housing Element as Program 8.</p> |

Merced County Association of Governments
Merced County Multi-Jurisdictional Housing Element (2024-2032)

| Program | Program Objectives | Progress and Continued Appropriateness |
|--|---|--|
| <p>Program 8 — First-Time Homebuyer Program: Continue to identify and apply for funding in order to continue the City's first-time homebuyer program to help lower-income homebuyers, including extremely low-, very low-, and low-income, with downpayment and closing costs.</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to assist five households annually.</p> | <p>The City discontinued promoting the First Time Homebuyer Program on the City's website and in-person, due to market constraints limiting the ability for low-income households to qualify for mortgages.</p> <p>Continued Appropriateness: Program 8 will be revised to accommodate market constraints and incorporated into the 6th Cycle Housing Element as Program 13.</p> |
| <p>Program 9 — Extremely Low-Income Housing Development Funding: Support applications for funding for the development of extremely low-income housing. Research potential funding opportunities and reach out to affordable housing developers on an annual basis to identify grants or loans and provide expedited processing of applications for the development of extremely low-income housing.</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to support at least one extremely low-income housing development.</p> | <p>City Staff continues to support development of extremely low-income housing and will assist developers in technical assistance to secure monies for the development of such housing. City Staff continues supporting annual research funding opportunities and reach out to affordable housing developers.</p> <p>Continued Appropriateness: Program 9 is ongoing and will be incorporated into the 6th Cycle Housing Element as Program 8.</p> |
| <p>Program 10 — Farmworker Housing: Support regional efforts, such as those of the Merced County Housing Authority and other organizations, to identify sites, including sites within the SOI, and secure funding for permanent and seasonal farmworker housing. Provide assistance in the form of reduced development standards and/or fee deferrals to developers of affordable farmworker housing.</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to work with local non-profit developers to secure funds for one farmworker housing and provide assistance to two farmworker housing.</p> | <p>The City supports the Merced County Housing Authority to provide for development of farmworker housing. City Staff annually reaches out to affordable developers.</p> <p>Continued Appropriateness: Program 10 is ongoing and will be revised and incorporated into the 6th Cycle Housing Element as Program 1 and Program 8</p> |
| <p>Program 11 – Section 8 Rental Assistance: Encourage new multifamily apartment owners to participate in the Housing Choice (Section 8) Voucher Program by accepting vouchers at their complexes. Refer extremely low and very low-income households seeking rental assistance to the Merced County Housing Authority's Housing Choice Voucher Program.</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to promote participation by new apartment owners in the Section 8 program.</p> | <p>The City refers extremely low and very-low income households to the Merced County Housing's Housing Choice Voucher Program.</p> <p>Continued Appropriateness: Program 11 is ongoing and will be revised and incorporated into the 6th Cycle Housing Element as Program 11.</p> |
| <p>Program 12 — Housing Program Information. Make information on housing, housing programs, and housing assistance available to all members of the community, including information on second units and information on the availability of sites at the Monte Cristo Mobile Home Park. Continue to provide materials in both Spanish and English. Place information at a public counter in City Hall, and the City's website, and at other public locations.</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to provide information on housing programs and assistance to residents.</p> | <p>The City continues to provide information on the City website and in person.</p> <p>Continued Appropriateness: Program 12 is ongoing and will be revised and incorporated into the 6th Cycle Housing Element as Program 13.</p> |

| Program | Program Objectives | Progress and Continued Appropriateness |
|---|--|--|
| <p>Program 13 – Infrastructure Improvements: Continue to identify and apply for loans and grants to improve and upgrade City infrastructure, such as the water, sewer, storm drainage, and circulation system in order to meet future residential, industrial, and commercial demand. Give priority to providing infrastructure to vacant R-3 parcels, especially those in the southeastern portion of the city, as well as DTC parcels in order to support the development of multifamily housing in these areas.</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to apply for at least one grant/loan. Target efforts toward expanding infrastructure to support the development of multi-family housing on vacant R-3 parcels.</p> | <p>The City received grant funding for water line improvements and completed construction in 2019. The City continues to research grant opportunities for infrastructure funding. City Staff shall continue to apply for CDBG funds at least biennially. Continued Appropriateness: Program 13 was established in 2017 and shall be reviewed biennially. The program will be revised and incorporated into the 6th Cycle Housing Element as Program 14.</p> |
| <p>Program 14 — Impact Fee Program: Periodically review and update the City's impact fees to ensure that they are consistent with the City's costs to provide these services and that they do not act as a constraint to residential development.</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to review City fees to ensure that they are not a constraint to affordable development.</p> | <p>The City reviewed the Development Impact Fee Program biennially to ensure that the fees are consistent with the City's costs. Continued Appropriateness: Program 14 is ongoing and will be revised and incorporated into the 6th Cycle Housing Element as Program 8.</p> |
| <p>Program 15 — Provide Information on Reasonable Accommodation: Consistent with the Reasonable Accommodation provisions of City Code, prepare a notice of availability of reasonable accommodation for persons with disabilities, including developmental disabilities, and display it prominently at the public information counter in the Planning and Building Departments advising the public of the availability of the procedure. Make forms for requesting reasonable accommodation available to the public in the Planning and Building Departments.</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to promote reasonable accommodation procedures.</p> | <p>The City provides information related to Reasonable Accommodation as requests are received. Information is provided in person when development proposals and applications are submitted. Continued Appropriateness: Program 15 is ongoing and will be revised and incorporated into the 6th Cycle Housing Element as Program 13.</p> |
| <p>Program 16 — Permitting Fees: As appropriate and feasible, waive, reduce or defer permitting fees for new housing developments in the city affordable to extremely low-, very low-, and moderate-income households</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to waive, reduce, or defer fees and application requirements for two affordable housing projects.</p> | <p>As development applications are received, the City may consider the waiver of development impact fees for new housing developments affordable to extremely low-, very low-, and moderate-income households. Continued Appropriateness: Program 16 is ongoing and will be revised and incorporated into the 6th Cycle Housing Element as Program 8.</p> |
| <p>Program 17 – Remove CUP Requirement in R-3 Zone: The City shall amend the Zoning Ordinance to remove the Conditional Use Permit requirement for projects within the R-3 Zone District that consist of 25 units or more or a density of 24 units per acre or more. The City shall continue to require site plan approval for projects within the R-3 zone.</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to remove the CUP requirement for multifamily residential uses in the R-3 zone.</p> | <p>This program was established in 2018 and will be completed during the next Zoning Ordinance amendment. Continued Appropriateness: Program 17 will be completed as part of the next Zoning Ordinance Amendment and will not be incorporated into the 6th Cycle Housing Element.</p> |

Merced County Association of Governments
Merced County Multi-Jurisdictional Housing Element (2024-2032)

| Program | Program Objectives | Progress and Continued Appropriateness |
|--|---|---|
| <p>Program 18 – Permit Streamlining: Continue to encourage applicants to meet for pre-application conferences to address any issues before the application is submitted. As funding permits, hire additional planning staff to handle permit processing.</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to reduce processing and permit times.</p> | <p>City Staff continues to encourage developers to apply for a pre-application and meet with Department Representatives to discuss proposed development.</p> <p>Continued Appropriateness: Program 18 is ongoing and will be revised and incorporated into the 6th Cycle Housing Element as Program 6.</p> |
| <p>Program 19 – Development Handbook: Develop an informational handbook for developers interested in building in Livingston. The handbook should include information on permit processing requirements, steps in the process, and a schedule of building and permitting fees, among others. The handbook should be designed to provide information, answer typical questions, and reduce confusion about the permit process for developers. Continue to maintain and update information on the City's website.</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to provide informational handbooks to developers.</p> | <p>The Development Handbook was developed in 2020.</p> <p>Continued Appropriateness: Program 19 was completed in 2020 and will not be incorporated into the 6th Cycle Housing Element.</p> |
| <p>Program 20 – Expedited Processing. Provide expedited processing for developments that contain units that are affordable to extremely low-, very-low-, and low-income households as well as special needs groups, such as persons with disabilities, including developmental disabilities. The City will also provide expedited processing to commercial and industrial projects by businesses, with will generate higher paying jobs in the community.</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to provide expedited processing for affordable housing projects as well as commercial and industrial projects that create high paying jobs for residents.</p> | <p>City Staff continues to offer expedited application processing for projects as well as commercial and industrial developments.</p> <p>Continued Appropriateness: Program 20 is ongoing and will be revised and incorporated into the 6th Cycle Housing Element as Program 8.</p> |
| <p>Program 21 – Zoning for Special Needs Housing: Amend the Zoning Ordinance to: allow residential care facilities for more than 15 persons in appropriate zones in the city; and add a definition of single-room occupancy (SRO) and allow SROs in the DTC zone.</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to amend the Zoning Ordinance.</p> | <p>The City amended it's Zoning Ordinance to allow for ADUs and JADUs in all residential and DTC districts. Zoning for Special Needs Housing will be incorporated into the Zoning Ordinance during the next Zoning Ordinance amendment. program will be completed in FY 2023/24.</p> <p>Continued Appropriateness: Program 21 will be completed as part of the next Zoning Ordinance Amendment and will not be incorporated into the 6th Cycle Housing Element.</p> |
| <p>Program 22 – Conservation of Affordable Housing: Monitor affordable multifamily housing projects to help prevent the conversion of affordable units to market rate. Work with non-profit organizations and other agencies to preserve the affordability of these units. Ensure tenants are properly noticed and informed of their rights and</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to preserve 99 at-risk units.</p> | <p>The City continues to monitor multifamily housing projects to help prevent the conversion of affordable housing to market-rate. The City will reach out to any that may convert within the 6th Cycle.</p> <p>Continued Appropriateness: Program 22 is ongoing and will be revised and</p> |

| Program | Program Objectives | Progress and Continued Appropriateness |
|--|---|---|
| eligibility to obtain special Section 8 vouchers reserved for tenants of converted HUD properties. | | incorporated into the 6 th Cycle Housing Element as Program 9. |
| Program 23 – Housing Rehabilitation Program: Continue to provide loans to lower-income households and special needs groups, such as seniors and the disabled, for rehabilitation assistance and emergency housing repairs. | The objective of this program is to provide rehabilitation and emergency repair assistance to five lower-income owner and renter households annually. | This program is Not active due to the lack of HUD funding. The City currently manages a portfolio of existing rehabilitation loans. Continued Appropriateness: Program 23 is ongoing and will be revised and incorporated into the 6 th Cycle Housing Element as Program 10. |
| Program 24 – Overcrowding Reduction: Encourage developers of both affordable and market- rate housing to construct housing units with three or more bedrooms to accommodate large households and alleviate overcrowding in Livingston. Where feasible, provide incentives to developers who provide housing units affordable to lower-income households that have three or more bedrooms. Such incentives may include, but are not limited to flexible development standards, fee deferrals, density bonus, or expedited processing. | The objective of this program is to encourage two affordable developments and two market-rate rental developments to include units with three or more bedrooms. | The City encourages development of housing units with three or more bedrooms, as well as incorporating ADUs during meetings with prospective developers. Continued Appropriateness: Program 24 is ongoing and will be revised and incorporated into the 6 th Cycle Housing Element as Program 8. |
| Program 25 – Code Enforcement: Continue code enforcement efforts to identify substandard housing and housing in need of substantial rehabilitation. Provide information about the City's rehabilitation program to low-income and moderate-income households with homes or apartments in need of repairs. | The objective of this program is to identify substandard housing or housing with code violations and provide information on rehabilitation programs to eligible households. | The City continues Code Enforcement efforts to identify substandard housing conditions. Continued Appropriateness: Program 25 is ongoing and will be revised and incorporated into the 6 th Cycle Housing Element as Program 10. |
| Program 26 – Fair Housing Services. Collaborate with the County and fair housing service providers that serve the County to: 1) identify funding sources to support fair housing and landlord/tenant counseling programs; 2) provide information on fair housing laws at City Hall, the library, senior center, on the City's website, and other areas in which the community gathers information. And 3) address or refer complaints of housing discrimination to appropriate State or federal agencies. | The objective of this program is to work in partnership with local fair housing service agencies and provide fair housing information and services to residents. | The City continues to work with the County of Merced to identify funding sources and provide additional information to support fair housing. Continued Appropriateness: Program 26 is ongoing and will be incorporated into the 6 th Cycle Housing Element as Program 13. |
| Program 27 – Weatherization Assistance: Continue to provide weatherization assistance to lower-income households through the City's rehabilitation program. Provide information at City Hall on PG&E and the Merced Irrigation District's (MID) weatherization and energy assistance program. | The objective of this program is to provide weatherization to five lower-income owner and renter households annually through the Housing Rehabilitation Program. | The City provides information related to energy savings from PG&E and the Merced Irrigation District to residents. Continued Appropriateness: Program 27 is ongoing and will be revised and incorporated into the 6 th Cycle Housing Element as Program 10. |

Merced County Association of Governments
Merced County Multi-Jurisdictional Housing Element (2024-2032)

| Program | Program Objectives | Progress and Continued Appropriateness |
|---|---|--|
| <p>Program 28 – Innovative Neighborhood Design: Encourage the use of pedestrian-oriented design, greenbelts, parks, bicycle routes, and open-space to enhance new residential neighborhoods in Livingston. Make available on the City's Website the City's Design Guidelines.</p> | <p>The objective of this program is to encourage developers to use designs that incorporate smart growth and community sustainability practices, such as the use of greenbelts or walkways, which enhance pedestrian and bicycle use.</p> | <p>The City encourages developers to use designs that encourage Smart Growth and consistency with the City's Design Guidelines.</p> <p>Continued Appropriateness: Program 28 is ongoing and will be revised incorporated into the 6th Cycle Housing Element as Program 12.</p> |